



CENTER FOR RESEARCH ON EMPLOYMENT OF SPECIAL POPULATIONS

## RESEARCH REPORT

# Promoting Economic Growth and Development of the Bedouin Population in Southern Israel: Education

Second Report on Government Resolution 3708

Yonatan Eyal ♦ Suzan Hasan ♦ Moria Frankel ♦ Judith King

The study was commissioned by the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development

# **Promoting Economic Growth and Development of the Bedouin Population in Southern Israel: Education**

## **Second Report on Government Resolution 3708**

Yonatan Eyal

Suzan Hasan

Moria Frankel

Judith King

The study was commissioned by the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development

Jerusalem

December 2016

Hebrew editor: Raya Cohen

English translation: Evelyn Abel

Production and print layout: Leslie Klineman

**Myers-JDC-Brookdale Institute**

P.O.B. 3886

Jerusalem 9103702, Israel

Tel: (02) 655-7400

Fax: (02) 561-2391

Website: <http://brookdale.jdc.org.il>



## Related Myers-JDC-Brookdale Institute Publications

Sofer Furman, H.; Eyal, Y.; Hassan-Daher, S.; Frankel, M. 2016. *Program to Promote Economic Growth and Development for the Bedouin Population in the South of Israel. (Government Resolution 3708) – First Report*. RR-714-16 (Hebrew)

Hassan-Daher, S. 2012. *Promoting and Developing Business Entrepreneurship among Bedouin Women in the Negev*. RR-624-12 (Hebrew)

Judith King, J.; Raanan, R. 2011. *Maavarim (Transitions): Rural Employment Center in the Bedouin Sector in the Negev – Khura and Segev Shalom Evaluation Report*. RR-591-11 (Hebrew)

Ben Rabi, D.; Amiel, S.; Nijim, F.; Dolev, T. 2009. *Bedouin Children in the Negev: Characteristics, Needs and Patterns of Service Use*. RR-532-09 (Hebrew)

Nurit Strosberg, N.; Naon, D.; Ziv, A. 2008. *Special-needs Children in the Bedouin Population of the Negev: Characteristics, Patterns of Service Use, and the Impact of Caring for the Children on the Mothers* RR-503-08 (Hebrew)

They are available on the institute website: [www.jdc.org.il/brookdale](http://www.jdc.org.il/brookdale)

# Executive Summary

## 1. Introduction

This is the second report of the study on the implementation of Israel Government Resolution 3708 concerning the development of the Bedouin sector in the south of Israel. The Resolution relates to the five-year plan of 2012-16 to promote the economic growth and development of the Bedouin population and their integration into Israel's economy and society. The government built a framework for the integration of the Negev Bedouin population to monitor and appraise the implementation of the five-year plan. This framework is part of the planning authority of the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development and it deals also with formulating and further planning of the development program, which is scheduled to start in 2017.

The first report of this study was submitted in July 2015. It dealt with a number of topics: employment, infrastructure - with emphasis on transportation and frameworks for children, and reinforcing personal safety in the various localities.

This report examines the implementation of the Resolution as regards the Ministry of Education and its efforts to promote education among the Bedouin population in the Negev. The expectation is that better education would lead to better integration into employment and to the development of the Bedouin sector. The budget allocated for the implementation of the Resolution was NIS 1,263.3 million. The education budget was NIS 124.4 million or 9.8% of the overall budget. Part of this sum comes from the ministry budget (24%) and part is defined as a supplementary budget, which is added on to the Ministry budget (76%).. The report covers developments up to April 2016.

A conclusive report is planned for mid-2017.

The study was commissioned by the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development.

## 2. Study Goals and Research Methods in the Area of Education

### 2.1 Goals

- ♦ *Examination of the implementation of the Resolution 3708*
  - A survey of activities undertaken to implement the Resolution in each of six areas of education included in the resolution, and identifying the successes and challenges of implementation
  - Examination of the extent of activity
- ♦ *Examination of the short-term outcomes of program participation subject to available data*

This report presents the immediate outcomes of the programs included in the resolution according to the data currently in our possession. In the next report we will examine the outcomes in the longer run at the population or locality levels.

## 2.2. Data Sources

During the study, data were collected from several supplementary sources:

- ◆ In-depth interviews with the personnel in charge of program implementation, office-holders in Bedouin local authorities, in civil society, government ministries and education networks. Most of the interviews were conducted between November 2015 and February 2016. Ordinary citizens were not interviewed.
- ◆ Study tours
- ◆ Issues raised in steering committee meetings
- ◆ Research reports and reviews
- ◆ Administrative databases, including of the Ministry of Education
- ◆ Central Bureau of Statistics (CBS).

## 2.3 The Steering Committee as Consultant to the Study

The study was accompanied by a steering committee comprising representatives of the ministries that have bearing on the program as well as Bedouin local authorities, professionals and scholars engaged in this area.

## 3. Background

In 2014, the Bedouin population in the south numbered 230,000 or 2.7% of Israel's population. Of these, 76% lived in state-recognized localities; 24% in non-recognized localities (CBS, 2015).<sup>1</sup> The recognized localities are the city of Rahat, which numbers more than 60,000 residents (CBS website, 2014),<sup>2</sup> six local councils and two regional councils. The non-recognized localities are not connected to the electric grid or the water and sewage system. Their road infrastructure is poor, they have few public services, and residents do not pay municipal or local taxes. ***The government Resolution relates only to recognized localities.***

At the time of data collection, all the recognized Bedouin localities belonged to the socio-economic cluster of 1 or 2. Recently, the five localities that belonged to cluster 2 moved down to cluster 1.

The chapter on Resolution 3708, which deals with the promotion of education stipulates six areas:

- ◆ Programs to improve scholastic achievement, narrow gaps, enhance perseverance and complete matriculation
- ◆ Upgrading science-technology education and establishing a post-secondary school division for technological studies
- ◆ Strengthening excellent students and promoting excellence

---

<sup>1</sup> CBS, 21.10.2015. Localities and Population in Israel. 2014. Press Release.

<sup>2</sup> Data on the number of residents in Rahat as of 2014. Retrieved from the CBS website:  
[http://www.cbs.gov.il/reader/?MIval=cw\\_usr\\_view\\_SHTML&ID=807](http://www.cbs.gov.il/reader/?MIval=cw_usr_view_SHTML&ID=807)

- ◆ Career education
- ◆ Completion of education
- ◆ Expansion of informal education.

As noted, the total education budget under the Resolution was NIS 124.4 million. The area of informal education and the area of improving achievement and narrowing gaps received the largest shares, 32% each. The upgrading of technological education received 15%.

This study concerns only activities and programs funded under Resolution 3708. Construction of kindergartens, classrooms and auxiliary rooms – a topic with significant implications for the education system - is dealt with in a separate government decision.<sup>4</sup>

We are fully aware that there are other programs which deal directly or indirectly with the problems of dropout, low achievement and other issues. However, this report does not focus upon them.

The following sections describe the activities of each of the six areas of education cited in the Resolution.

## 4. Programs to Improve Scholastic Achievement, Narrow Gaps, Enhance Perseverance and Complete Matriculation, Under the Resolution

### 4.1 Description of Area

#### a. Preventing dropout

**The problem:** Bedouin students show high rates of dropout from the education system, especially in the transition from grades 8 to 9. The overall dropout rate of 17-year-olds in the sector in 2015 was 28.9%.

The *formal apparatus* for dealing with dropout in the Bedouin sector in the Negev consists of 15 truancy officers.

Two main initiatives were funded under the resolution:

1. The ***Nahshon Program*** was designed to prevent the dropout of 8<sup>th</sup>-graders on the verge of doing so by supporting them during their studies in grades 8 and 9. This support takes the form of intensive supplementary schooling, emotional treatment from a psychologist, and social empowerment.
2. The ***Startup for Industry Program***, referred to in the section on scientific-technological education in this report, is also intended to prevent dropout.

---

<sup>4</sup> Our attempts to obtain data from the Ministry of Education on the extent of construction were unsuccessful.



## b. Improving scholastic achievements

**The problem:** The GEMS scores show lower scores for Bedouin students in elementary and middle school than for non-Bedouin students (other Arab students, Druze and Jews). The gaps begin in early childhood, in preschool, and widen over the years.

Two main initiatives were funded under the resolution:

1. The online program, ***Let's Read Together in Arabic***, is designed to make it easier for 1<sup>st</sup>-and 2<sup>nd</sup>-graders to acquire reading and writing skills, and to develop a vocabulary in literary Arabic.
2. ***Reinforcement Hours*** – All grades from kindergarten through high school (even prior to the government Resolution) offer age-appropriate enrichment in a variety of core subjects (including Hebrew).

## c. Eligibility for matriculation certificate

**The problem:** The rates of eligibility for a general matriculation certificate in the Bedouin sector were far lower than in the Arab sector (excluding Bedouin and Druze) – 30.3% versus 47.8% respectively of 17-year-olds in 2014. As expected, the eligibility rates for a matriculation certificate meeting university prerequisites were lower still.

Four main initiatives were funded under the resolution:

1. ***Reinforcement***: To increase the rate of students eligible for a matriculation certificate, reinforcement classes in matriculation subjects were offered in grades 11 and 12 to some 400 groups in 30 schools.
2. ***The Matriculation Completion Program***, implemented since 2000-01, addresses 11<sup>th</sup>-and 12<sup>th</sup>-graders missing only one or two subjects to be eligible for a matriculation certificate.
3. The ***Identification and Diagnosis Program*** of students with learning disabilities: Another way of raising the rate of recipients of matriculation certificates is to increase eligibility among students with learning disabilities. Students diagnosed as level 3 (the top level of learning disabilities) are entitled to the highest level of examinee concessions. The project of identifying and diagnosing them permits coverage of the cost of psycho-didactic diagnoses.
4. The ***Matriculation Re-Examination Program***, implemented since 2010-11, is designed to give a second chance to students who finished grade 12, sat for the matriculation exams, and failed in one or two subjects, thereby forfeiting the certificate. They are invited to participate in a preparatory course for re-examination in the winter session on the subject/s blocking their way to a certificate.

## 4.2 Salient Achievements

### Increasing the number of participants

- ◆ In the ***Nahshon Program***, to prevent dropout, the number of participant schools increased from 4 in 2012-13 to 16 in 2015-16; the number of students – from 120 to 478.
- ◆ In ***Let's Read Together in Arabic***, the number of students increased from 150 in 2014-15 to 910 in 2015-16.



### Outcomes of program participation

- ◆ In the *Matriculation Completion Program* in 2013-14, the percentage of Bedouin students passing the exam in the subject that had blocked their way was 94%. This percentage was the same for all program participants, Jews and Arabs, on the national level.
- ◆ The percentage of Bedouin participants in the *Matriculation Completion Program* eligible for a matriculation certificate was virtually identical to that of program participants countrywide – 83.7% and 82.6% respectively.

### Professionalization of staff implementing the program

- ◆ In the *Identification and Diagnosis Program of children with learning disabilities*, school staff were trained to identify, assess (not diagnose) and report precisely on students with learning disabilities, and to work with parents.
- ◆ In the *Matriculation Completion Program*, in almost all the participant Bedouin schools in 2013-14, the tasks of program coordination, teaching and professional counseling were performed by school staff teachers who had been trained and received supervision.

### Egalitarian distribution of scholarships

In the *Identification and Diagnosis Program* of students with learning disabilities, an attempt was made to distribute scholarships more equally by pooling the scholarship resources of the Ministry of Education or of its projects. Clear criteria were set for the number of scholarships to be received by each school participating in the project.

## 4.3. Salient Challenges

### Lack of coordination between budget systems

The budget of the Ministry of Finance relates to the calendar year whereas that of the Ministry of Education relates to the school year. Since a program cannot be launched without the annual budget approval, the ensuing delay may cause it to start functioning only in the middle of the school year.

### Lack of transportation and school buses

Certain activities, such as scholastic reinforcement, take place after school. However, as there is no public transportation then and school buses do not work at these hours, students who live far away find it difficult to participate. While solutions are sometimes found – for instance, being driven by parents – these are local rather than system-wide and usually initiated by a school principal.

### Staff problems

The teaching staff suffers from high turnover (although less so than in the past) since many teachers hail from the north and leave to return home after a given period. In addition, it is difficult to recruit truancy officers.

### Budget difficulties or shortage of funds

Budget problems preclude the expansion of the program to additional schools (as in the case of *Matriculation Completion*).

### Implementing the program on an annual basis

The opening of classes for the Nahshon Program requires renewed approval every year. A school that implemented the program receives no commitment from the ministry that it will be able to open a new class the following year. This prevents a school from accumulating knowledge and expertise in the program.

### Lack of adequate follow-up for purposes of monitoring and evaluation

Regarding the *Identification and Diagnosis* of students with learning disabilities, there is no long-term follow-up of the achievements of students who had been granted concessions during their matriculation exams. It is therefore impossible to evaluate the contribution of the concessions.

## 5. Upgrading Science-Technology Education and Establishing a Post-Secondary School Division of Technological Studies

### 5.1 Description of Area

The science-technology curriculum in high school (grades 10-12) covers various tracks of study at three levels: matriculation in engineering, basic studies for a technician's/ practical engineer's certificate, and vocational training. Education networks (such as ORT, Amal, Sakhnin, Atid and Amit) play an important part in the ongoing management of the schools, and the development of curricula and teaching staff in addition to the ministry role. In 2014-15 in the southern district of the Ministry of Education, 23,800 students pursued the science-technology track, some 45% of all students in grades 10-12.

Five main initiatives were funded under the resolution:

1. The *Technician + Matriculation* track: Studies towards both matriculation and a technician's certificate, in the framework of 12 years of study and free of tuition
2. *Startup for Industry*:<sup>5</sup> The program addresses youth at risk in grades 10-12. Its goal is to prevent dropout, provide a basis for qualifying as a technician / practical engineer, and offer the opportunity of studying towards employment in a profession.
3. *Continuing track of technician/ practical engineering studies (grades 13-14)* towards a certificate: This track was not available in the Bedouin sector despite the explicit stipulation in Resolution 3708.
4. *Upgrading and developing/ opening study tracks*: Upgrading existing tracks and opening new ones
5. *Promoting teaching*: Further studies, seminars and instruction for teachers.

---

<sup>5</sup> In 2015-16 the name of the program changed to Student Integration into Industry.

## **5.2 Salient Achievements**

### **Upgrading and opening study tracks in technological education**

- ◆ In the entire Bedouin sector, 13 new tracks were opened and 42 were upgraded.
- ◆ 5 Technology + Matriculation classes were opened in new schools, on top of the 3 schools that had offered them before the Resolution
- ◆ 14 Startup for Industry classes were opened; the program did not exist in the Bedouin sector before the Resolution.

### **Promotion of teaching**

Teachers in the Bedouin sector are offered further technological studies and specific seminar days every year. In addition, they receive an allocation for 6 days of instruction.

## **5.3 Salient Challenges**

### **Challenges of the Technician + Matriculation track:**

*A low rate of students finish secondary school with a matriculation certificate or a technician's/ practical engineer's diploma.*

In the Negev Bedouin sector, 28.4% of the students finished the track with matriculation and 12.7% were eligible for a technician's or practical engineer's certificate. In contrast, the national rates were 70.7% and 20.5 % respectively.

### **Examinations in 10<sup>th</sup>-grade**

Since 2014-15, there have been no matriculation exams in the 10<sup>th</sup> grade. This decision has placed a heavier burden on students in the Technical + Matriculation track who sit for exams at the end of 12<sup>th</sup> grade for both matriculation and a technician's certificate.

### **Startup for Industry**

#### **Regulation hours in the program**

The five startup classes in 2015-16 did not receive approval for a higher standard of hours.

### **Challenges of the grades 13-14 track**

Despite the stipulation in Resolution 3708, no such track was established in the Bedouin sector for a technician's/ practical engineer's certificate.

### **Common challenges of the science-technology education system**

The technology track demands a combination of professional knowledge and pedagogic ability, as well as the knowhow to stand before a population comprising a considerable rate of at-risk students. It is difficult to find teachers meeting these three demands.

### **Integration of girls**

The integration of girls demands adjustments as regards study tours and other activities outside of the locality.

## **6. Strengthening Excellent Students and Promoting Excellence**

### **6.1 Description of Area**

The Division for Gifted and Outstanding Students at the Ministry of Education is responsible for cultivating excellent students. The Bedouin sector has centers of excellence designed for students in grades 3-6 and operating one day a week after school. The studies consist of compulsory subjects in science and technology as well as elective courses, such as art and robotics. Every center has a coordinator responsible for its activities. A pedagogic instructor helps out at all the centers.

### **6.2 Salient Achievements**

#### **Establishing and operating centers of excellence**

Prior to Resolution 3708, there was a single center of excellence in Rahat, and it had closed down. In 2015-16, there were five centers (in Rahat, Tel Sheva, Arara in the Negev, Kseife, and Hura) with the participation of 685 students.

#### **Training teaching staff**

An apparatus was developed to train teachers of gifted students at the centers of excellence, along with a special training track at Ben-Gurion University of the Negev for professionalizing the teaching of gifted and excellent students.

#### **Professional equipment**

The centers are outfitted with professional equipment of the highest level, such as laptops, science laboratories, various musical instruments, and robotics kits.

### **6.3 Salient Challenges**

#### **Difficulties in recruiting professional teachers**

It is difficult to find expert, broadminded subject teachers suitable for the program, especially in art and music.

#### **Limited number of students**

The program accepts a limited number of students who constitute only a small portion of all the students with potential. This limitation is especially striking in Rahat: only two students in every grade are chosen while in most localities, two students per class are chosen.

#### **Delays in acquiring center equipment**

Every center of excellence is autonomous vis-à-vis its local authority. At times, there are delays in acquiring necessary equipment for center activities as the local authority lags behind the requests submitted by the centers.

#### **Transportation difficulties**

Transportation arrangements for the program have not been finalized so that, in fact, if no transportation is organized by the local authority, or parents are unable to drive the students, they cannot participate in the program.

### **Lack of a continuing program**

Although there are quite a few programs in the area of gifted children and excellence in various classes and frameworks, there is no continuing program for the centers of excellence. Moreover, the program implementers do not tend to cooperate.

## **7. Career Education**

### ***7.1 Description of Area***

The purpose of career education programs is to help students make informed decisions about their studies and future employment choices. In Israel, career education is not a formal part of school activity. Thus, most of the programs currently active in schools were initiated either by the Third Sector or the school. The purpose of the career education program, which began following Resolution 3708, was to train members of the school teaching staff in the area of choosing and planning a career so that they would be able to run workshops for the students.

### ***7.2 Salient Achievements***

#### **Expansion of activity**

Activity in this area prior to Resolution 3708 was limited. Following the Resolution, a compulsory career program was implemented in all secondary schools in the Bedouin sector. In 2015-16 the program operated in 148 classes – all 12 grades and sometimes also grade 11.

#### **Training teaching staff at various levels**

School counseling and teaching staff were trained as follows: two courses for counselors; 30 courses for classroom teachers; and 100 seminars for teachers.

#### **Sustaining the program in schools**

The program strives towards sustainability in schools by establishing work processes and a reserve of professional career educators.

#### **Cooperation with external agencies**

Cooperation with external agencies helped to build a program that was adapted to the population. Initially, it also helped to advance the program in schools.

### ***7.3 Salient Challenges***

#### **Difficulty in recruiting parents**

This past year showed considerable improvement in the extent of parental involvement as a result of the teachers' enlistment in the task and the alternatives found to reach parent groups; for example: the Shig (the informal council of a tribe's adult males), religious studies, and education completion classes. Nevertheless, some parents still do not participate whether because of transportation difficulties or a lack of interest.

#### **Lack of framework for professional support**

There is a lack of frameworks or functions responsible for providing support and responding to issues raised by counselors and classroom teachers.

### **Lack of cooperation on the part of the school**

Some school staffs do not cooperate in the promotion of career education whether because they are unaware of its importance or because they prefer to focus on improving the students' scholastic achievements.

### **Lack of activities for students of grades 9, 10 and 11**

There is a need to expand career education to grades 9, 10 and 11 to help students make informed decisions about courses of study at school and to plan for the future.

## **8. Education Completion – Secondary School Equivalency**

### ***8.1 Description of Area***

The Division of Adult Education at the Ministry of Education is in charge of courses to help the population complete 12 years of schooling. There are several tracks at different school levels, from pre-elementary to 12 years without matriculation. Graduates receive a diploma for 8, 10 or 12 years of schooling. Students take screening tests before being placed in the different levels.

### ***8.2 Salient Achievements***

#### **Increase in number of classes**

Prior to the Resolution, there were isolated classes. In the years since the Resolution, the numbers have grown to a total of 69, with the participation numbering 1,283 students.

#### **Continuing studies**

The Resolution and the many courses that opened it its wake made possible continuing studies and direct, uninterrupted passage from one level to another. Furthermore, the Division for Adult Education was able to admit to the new classes students who had failed a course – a provision that was previously not possible.

#### **Empowerment of Bedouin women**

95% of the course participants were women, one of the main target populations cited in Resolution 3708.

### ***8.3. Salient Challenges***

#### **Low rate of eligibility for school certificates**

The rate of eligibility for diplomas in the years since the Resolution was only about 33.3% and applied to students who had completed their studies in the program (excluding the pre-elementary track, which holds internal exams).

#### **Shortage of supervised frameworks for children**

The shortage of supervised frameworks for children makes it difficult for mothers to pursue studies.

#### **Difficulties in recruiting teachers and high turnover**

It is difficult to recruit and retain teachers due to the employment conditions – part-time work during the morning hours, an hourly wage and no benefits for accruing seniority.

**The program does not provide for completion towards a matriculation certificate although this provision does appear in the Resolution**

This omission could make it difficult for students with potential to continue on to academic studies or high-level professional studies. Note that the mandate of the Adult Education Division at the Ministry of Education allows for 12 years of schooling, excluding a matriculation certificate.

**Lack of counseling for continuing studies**

In the absence of counseling, female students have limited options for further education and employment.

**Delay in issuing the tender for program implementation (in 2014-15)**

This delay in turn caused delays in the transfer of funds. The result was partial utilization of the annual budget and a limited extent of activities.

## **9. Development and Expansion of Informal Education**

### ***9.1 Description of Area***

Ministry activities in informal education are implemented through the Society and Youth Administration. The target population comprises mostly students in grades 4-12. Six main initiatives were funded under the resolution:

- 1. Establishing youth movements:*** Youth movements serve as a framework of social activity to empower and improve the social skills of youth, particularly of low-achieving students who find it difficult to integrate into the school system.
- 2. School scout groups:*** These groups were established for children in Arab localities suffering from a shortage of informal education frameworks. They function in elementary school (grades 4-6). As part of their activities, teachers that received suitable training act as counselors and provide support for the groups of youngsters.
- 3. Implementing leadership and social involvement groups:*** The purpose of this activity is to prepare students for social life and train them to be involved citizens. The work is carried out at municipal centers that integrate all the leadership activities and programs in a local authority.
- 4. Representative groups in art and sports:*** These groups are established for students in grades 5-9 specializing in art or sports to represent their local authorities countrywide or compete in contests in Israel and abroad.
- 5. Camps:*** Camps are run by municipalities for students in kindergarten to 7th-grade and are subsidized. The Ministry of Education is responsible for covering the costs of participation and training staff to manage the camps and serve as counselors.
- 6. Prevention of youth vagrancy and delinquency:*** Appointed coordinators are responsible for identifying at-risk youth, including youth with special needs, and referring them to informal education frameworks in localities that provide activities and personal support to reduce vagrancy.



## **9.2 Salient Achievements**

### **Expanding the range and extent of activities and making them accessible to the target population**

In most areas, the extent of activities has greatly expanded since the government Resolution. Activities are held in schools and community centers in different neighborhoods to make them accessible to all students. Today, every locality offers a wide range of frameworks and activities, and participants number more than 13,000 children and youth. The following are the main achievements in this area:

- ◆ 13 youth movement branches were established – in contrast to the 2 that existed prior to the Resolution; in 2014-15, there were more than 3,000 participants.
- ◆ The number of youth in School Scout Groups showed a real increase from 74 prior to the Resolution to some 1,400 in 2014-15.
- ◆ 9 municipal centers were established to cultivate leadership and community involvement; through these, more than 160 youth groups were established as compared with the 30 that had been in place prior to the Resolution. In addition, new volunteering opportunities were created and student councils began functioning in various localities.

### **Planning and constructing work processes to implement the resolution**

Steering committees were established and a work plan was constructed defining the areas of activity, the targets of success, and the areas of responsibility and authority of the partners to implementation.

### **Creating partnerships and pooling resources**

Partnerships with national and local agencies made it possible to expand informal education activities in the localities.

### **Recruiting and training staff**

Staff were recruited and trained specifically to assume responsibility for implementation and to run informal education activities: a director of the Youth Unit of a local authority, coordinators for involvement, coordinators for leadership, teachers and counselors, youth counselors and so forth.

## **9.3. Salient Challenges**

### **Shortage of a permanent professional staff**

Most of the staff are temporary and turnover causes program instability and wastes resources on training.

### **Shortage of infrastructure and physical facilities**

A considerable portion of the activities are held in unsuitable facilities unfavorable to the work.

### **Activities inaccessible to students requiring transportation**

The activities are designed for all students in the Bedouin sector. However, in practice, most activities begin after school and end when there is no longer transportation for students who require it.

### **Difficulties in implementing representative art groups**

The problem arises from a shortage of professional staff in the Bedouin sector, deficient infrastructure, and unawareness of the topic on the part of the families. Consequently, a considerable portion of the groups operated more as enrichment classes for children rather than fulfilling their function of representing the population in their particular area of interest.

### **Difficulties in implementing the program to prevent youth vagrancy in the first year**

It was difficult to identify and approach children and youth in the first year. Also, there was a shortage of groups potentially suited to the population. The model adopted from a parallel program in the Jewish sector was incompatible.

## **10. Summary of Achievements and Challenges in Implementing Government Resolution 3708 in the Area of Education – an Overview**

The education programs under Resolution 3708 reflect innovation alongside continuity. Some of the programs reviewed in this report had already been active in previous five-year plans and, to a large extent, their implementation under the Resolution meant continuity (for example: reinforcement of studies towards matriculation). Others had begun as pilots before 2012-13 in the hope that they would be developed and expanded following the Resolution (for example: *Let's Read Together in Arabic*). A third portion consisted of new programs that had existed in the Jewish sector but not in the Bedouin one. These were now adapted to the Bedouin sector (for example: the Nahshon Program, to prevent dropout). In this regard, note that the southern district of the ministry developed areas that had essentially been inactive prior to the Resolution, for instance, informal education, career education and adult education.

The process of preparing to implement the Resolution stretched over a year so that implementation in fact began in 2012-13. The staff that managed and developed the program as part of the previous five-year plan participated in planning and adapting the new programs to the Bedouin sector. Since the Resolution, there has been a good deal of activity in the areas of education at the focus of the Resolution. It yielded good results, although it created additional challenges as well.

### **10.1 Salient Achievements**

#### **Implementing new programs, improving existing programs, and expanding the extent of participation**

- ◆ The development and implementation of new programs such as Nahshon, to prevent school dropout; Let's Read Together in Arabic, to impart reading and writing skills to 1<sup>st</sup>- and 2<sup>nd</sup>-graders; leadership and community involvement programs; Career Education and Centers of Excellence
- ◆ Expanding the extent of participants in activities that existed prior to the Resolution: the Matriculation Re-Examination Program, on one or two missing subjects; youth movements and school scout groups; the technological track of Startup for Industry, in the track of Technician + Matriculation and the program for completion of adult education.

- ◆ Improving the implementation of pre-Resolution programs, such as tools for the Identification and Diagnosis Program addressing students with learning disabilities; and adding narration and instructions for computer work in Let's Read Together in Arabic.

### **Professionalization of implementation staff**

- ◆ Creating special positions, such as counselors drawn from the school staff for Career Education, coordinators for Matriculation Completion in schools specializing in the method; coordinators of perseverance in the Nahshon dropout prevention program; school coordinators for Identification and Diagnosis of learning disabilities; and coordinators for leadership and community involvement in local authorities.
- ◆ Developing comprehensive training for the program staff: for example, training school staff to identify students, assess functioning, report precisely and work with parents (Identification and Diagnosis); the Ben-Gurion university track to professionalize the teaching of gifted and excellent students; and training courses for guidance counselors and classroom teachers drawn from the school staff to deliver workshops on the topics of choosing a profession and Career Education.

### **Enhancing program sustainability**

- ◆ Creating work processes and constructing workshop tools for both teachers and students in Career Education
- ◆ Program implementation by a school's permanent teaching staff following training for the Matriculation Re-Examination and Career Education programs
- ◆ Establishing youth units at the local authorities that integrate all the informal education activities, create round tables on the topic and boost the participation of a local authority in implementing and financing some activities – an arrangement that virtually did not exist prior to the Resolution.

### **Raising community awareness of the different aspects of education**

- ◆ Teaching staff: In the assessment of the interviewees, education counselors and teachers became increasingly aware of the importance of career education. They also developed a firmer conception of classroom teachers as educators, imparting to students the tools to choose a profession – a component that they had not previously regarded as an integral part of their job.
- ◆ Parents: In the assessment of the interviewees, parents revised their conception of the importance of studies for their children. Today, children's studies occupy a high place in parental priorities.

### **Creating partnerships and pooling resources at the national and local levels**

- ◆ Informal education: Cooperation with the National Program for Children and Youth at Risk and the program of City without Violence; partnerships with the Israel Association of Community Centers and Third Sector organizations working to promote informal education
- ◆ Career education: Cooperation with professionals and bodies active in the area of vocational and academic guidance that initially helped to build and implement the program in schools.

## **10.2 Salient Challenges**

### **Difficulties in implementing certain programs according to plan**

- ◆ Studies for technicians and practical engineering, Grades 13-14: this track never opened up or shut down soon after opening mainly because of the low level of the students and problems of tuition.
- ◆ Activities to prevent vagrancy of at-risk children: The model adopted from a comparable program in the Jewish sector was unsuitable and most of the coordinators left in the early stages. After special efforts, implementers managed to identify at-risk youth and the local Youth Units launched special activity groups for children and youth at risk, and children with special needs, in coordination and with the approval of the steering committee of the local authorities, which accompanied the implementation of the program.
- ◆ Representative groups in arts: Quite a few groups functioned more as enrichment activities for children rather than fulfilling a representative role.
- ◆ Enrichment classes for preschoolers: The activities ceased in most kindergartens due to staff problems and the added load on the supervisor.
- ◆ Startup for Industry: There was difficulty in finding companies prepared to accept students for practical training. The transfer of program implementation to the Tassiyeda NGO, which is linked to the Manufacturers Association of Israel, helped surmount the problem although the transfer process caused delays in the program.

### **Budgetary and logistic challenges**

- ◆ Budget shortages preclude program expansion despite demand; for example, in the case of Matriculation Re-Examination, children's camps, and school Scouts groups.
- ◆ Budget difficulties create uncertainty over program continuity and therefore lead to loss of public faith.
- ◆ Lack of coordination between budget systems: clashes between calendar year and school year (i.e., the Ministry of Education) often delay program starts and payment of staff salaries. Moreover, at the end of a calendar year, program outcomes are still unknown as the programs have not finished at this point – a predicament could detrimentally affect funding decisions.
- ◆ Delays in issuing tenders for program implementation (in 2014-15) caused delays in the transmission of funds. The result was only partial utilization of the yearly budget and a limited extent of activities (for example, in education completion).

### **Lack of coordination between and within government ministries implementing programs for the same target populations**

- ◆ Program continuity and bridging were inadequate, preventing the maximization of their benefits; for example: education completion programs (Ministry of Education) are not coordinated with vocational training programs (Ministry of the Economy) as regards the starting/finishing dates and the active channeling of participants; nor do the former include a matriculation track, thereby barring the option of continued studies along an academic or higher professional track.

- ◆ Lack of coordination between programs addressing the same population and implemented by different government ministries; for example, programs for at-risk youth implemented by the Ministry of Education and by Social Services; programs of excellence for students in grades 3-6 implemented by the Ministry of Education and comparable programs for students in junior high, implemented by the Ministry for the Development of the Negev and Galilee, with no connection between them; the same situation regarding Career Education programs by the Ministry of Education and comparable programs under the responsibility of the Council for Higher Education. "The fact that most of the ministries cited in [Resolution] 3708 act autonomously without horizontal coordination causes a whole that is not greater than its parts" (from the document: "The program to promote the economic growth and development of the Bedouin population in the Negev, execution versus planning in 2015," April 21, 2016). Sometimes there is insufficient coordination between the Ministry of Education and the ministries dealing with infrastructure, for example: the former finances the construction of a school but there may be no access road to the site or even no connection to the electric grid and to the water system.

### **Shortage of infrastructure and suitable physical facilities**

- ◆ A considerable portion of the informal education activities (youth movements, social involvement groups etc.) are held in unsuitable facilities and less than desirable conditions.
- ◆ There are not enough classrooms, laboratories and auxiliary rooms or suitable rooms for psychologists to perform diagnoses of learning disabilities.
- ◆ Some of the facilities lack infrastructure for electricity, water and hygiene. Using a generator instead is problematic in terms of duration and the quality of its heating/cooling capacity. According to principals and directors of local education departments, the inadequate functioning of school generators limits the use of computers (if there are any), as well as other school equipment.

### **Lack of access to activities for children who need to be driven, and transportation problems**

- ◆ Most activities, such as reinforcement studies, informal education, and centers of excellence start after school and end after transportation hours. Students requiring transportation are unable to participate in these activities.
- ◆ Also parents who require transportation are unable to participate in such activities as workshops in career education or meetings with a psychologist in the Nahshon Program (dropout), as these are held in the afternoon.
- ◆ The lack of proper access roads to some of the schools is responsible for considerable absenteeism on rainy days, harming both the students themselves and the general class coursework. Strikes called by a parents council or a local authority are another cause of absence.
- ◆ Geographically scattered preschoolers are driven to kindergarten clusters located at a central hub. Interviewees claimed that the drive along bumpy roads takes too long, is too hard for young children, and sometimes navigated in old buses. All these factors endanger the safety of the children and create parental reluctance to send their children.

### **Difficulties in recruiting and maintaining staff, and staff quality**

- ◆ There is a shortage of a suitably skilled staff, especially teachers at the level of 5-unit matriculation in the sciences, mathematics, and English; of art and sports instructors; of truancy officers; and of subject supervisors.
- ◆ The staff shows a high turnover: for example, teachers returning to the north, some of whom play leading roles such as subject coordinator or grade coordinator; instructors for the centers of excellence; for leadership and community involvement; and teachers for completion of education. The main reasons for the turnover are the return of staff members to the north or inadequate working conditions (part-time work, low pay, and lack of social benefits). Lack of continuity creates a vacuum in a school's managerial hierarchy, harms program stability, prevents the accumulation of knowledge and experience, and wastes resources on recruitment and training.

### **Weakness of local authorities**

- ◆ Budget problems prevent local authorities from meeting the demand of matching funds – for example, for informal education activities and the staff to implement it. Thus, the local authorities are unable to properly utilize the government budgets that, theoretically, they are meant to receive. The result is non- or partial implementation of a program.
- ◆ Local authorities face pressures of nepotism even when the said relatives are unqualified to hold program positions.

### **Challenges arising from the special socio-cultural characteristics of Bedouin**

- ◆ Tribal disputes interfere with regular education activity.
- ◆ Parents object to their daughters' participation in various activities, especially if these are conducted together with boys, outside of the community or in the evening; for example, study marathons for the Matriculation Completion Program, attendance at youth movement quarters or participation in subject studies in mixed classes for Startup for Industry.
- ◆ Parents are opposed to screening for learning disabilities, especially for girls, for fear that a diagnosis of this sort would harm their marital prospects.
- ◆ There is still considerable unawareness among parents and teaching staff of the importance of education areas that are not necessarily achievement-oriented, such as informal and career education.

### **Lack of measurable targets and outcome measures, and of short- and long-term follow-up and monitoring**

This is especially serious in the case of programs designed to improve achievement, such as eligibility for matriculation or completion of 12 years of schooling.

## 11. Programmatic Directions

Programmatic directions were formulated on the basis of the material emerging from the interviews, at the steering committee or on study tours. The following are the main ones, with reference to several programs by subject.

### **a. Promoting women's education and skills for their integration into the labor market**

- ◆ Creating separate classes for girls in grades 10-12, as in Haredi schools in the Jewish sector (following the article by Abu-Saad, 2013) to prevent girls from dropping out of the education system after grade 9.<sup>6</sup>
- ◆ Working with parents to change their attitudes and support girls education (see next paragraph)
- ◆ Adapting out-of-school frameworks of studies-related activities to the cultural restrictions on girls: just as overnights away from home have already been cancelled in the marathons for the Matriculation Completion Program and in Startup for Industry, professions and worksites for practical training are carefully matched for girls.

### **b. Strengthening parental involvement in the education process**

- ◆ Outreach to parents should be practiced for participation in lectures and workshops on relevant education topics in settings outside of their children's schools; for example, in their localities, in education completion courses, in the *Shig* and in religious studies. This method reportedly has been tried successfully in the context of career education.

### **c. Greater coordination between the ministries responsible for implementing Resolution 3708**

- ◆ Creating mechanisms and arrangements to improve coordination between programs designed for the same population and implemented by different ministries, for example, between: education completion courses of the Ministry of Education and vocational training courses of the Ministry of Economy; programs of excellence for Bedouin students: in grades 3-6, they attend programs of the Ministry of Education and later, in junior high, they attend similar programs of the Ministry for the Development of the Negev and the Galilee. Often, it is easier to achieve inter-ministerial coordination on the local than the national level.
- ◆ Examining possibilities for graduates with a diploma for 12 years of schooling to continue studying towards a matriculation certificate – the Education Completion Program does not provide for this element, denying access to academic studies.

### **d. Transportation of students and parents to education and culture facilities after regular school hours**

- ◆ Numerous resources are invested in extracurricular education activities and the transportation schedule should be adapted to permit the participation of the maximal number of students and parents.

---

<sup>6</sup> Abu-Saad, A. 2013. "Socio-political changes and the development of the formal education system among Bedouin in the Negev: dilemmas and challenges'." Bedouin in the Negev – Strategic Challenge for Israel. S. Daniel Abraham Center for Strategic Dialogue, Netanya Academic College.



#### **e. Strengthening Hebrew studies**

- ◆ Adapting the reinforcement of Hebrew studies to changing individual needs, such as sitting for school exams, entering the post-secondary education system – both academic and vocational, looking for work (professional Hebrew), and integrating into a worksite. Although this topic is not mentioned in the government Resolution, it is highly important throughout the school years.

#### **f. Greater educational endeavors for early childhood**

- ◆ Situating kindergartens closer to home for unrecognized localities instead of in distant clusters: in unrecognized localities, it is quite common for 3- and 4-year-olds not to attend kindergarten. Parents are anxious about sending them to kindergarten because of the distance involved, the travel time, and safety issues such as poor access roads, and sometimes rundown buses.
- ◆ Explaining the value and importance of early learning to the parents might persuade them to send these small children to kindergarten.

#### **g. Raising the level of the staff involved in program implementation, in both formal and informal education**

- ◆ Ongoing learning (occasional further training) to upgrade the professionalism of teachers and instructors in their areas of expertise, and elevate their commitment to both their role and to the population over time: This could well reduce the high turnover of teachers. According to senior personnel interviewed in the study, the professional level of some of the school teaching staff, psychologists, truancy officers, coordinators, and counselors in informal education is inadequate and they could benefit from further training.

#### **h. Involving principals and senior teaching staff in the planning stages of education work**

Attentiveness to the wishes and insights of principals and senior education staff, and involving them in choosing and designing projects: Staff members know the population very well and are familiar with their culture and norms (both explicit and tacit). Their involvement in the early planning stages would help them feel a sense of proprietorship over a program and encourage them to cooperate with the ministries.

#### **i. Follow-up and longitudinal studies for program evaluation**

- ◆ Examining both the method of implementation and the outcomes: Since numerous resources are invested in these programs, it is important to know whether they achieve their goals.

The study findings and the resulting programmatic directions were presented to the steering committee accompanying the study and discussed extensively on September 19, 2016. Points raised in the discussion were incorporated in this report. The findings of the study serve as input to the planning of the next Bedouin sector five year plan (2017-2021).

# Table of Contents

<b>Part I – Introduction, Study Goals, Study Design, Background, Literature Review</b>	<b>1</b>
1. Introduction	1
2. Study Design	2
2.1 The Goals of the Study on Education	2
2.2 Data Sources	2
2.3 The Consultant Steering Committee for the Study	3
3. Background	3
4. Review of the Literature	6
4.1 Difficulties and Deficiencies	6
4.2 Science-Technology Education	8
4.3 Career Education	9
4.4 Informal Education and Recreation Activity	9
4.5 Education Completion	10
<b>Part II - Findings</b>	<b>11</b>
1. Reducing Dropout, Narrowing Scholastic Gaps and Raising Eligibility Rates for a Matriculation Certificate	11
1.1 The Relevant Clause of the Resolution	11
1.2 First Sub-Area: Reducing Dropout and Increasing Scholastic Perseverance	12
1.3 Second Sub-Area: Improving Scholastic Achievements and Narrowing Gaps	13
1.4 Third Sub-Area: Raising Eligibility Rates for a Matriculation Certificate	21
1.5 Purchasing School Equipment	30
1.6 Reducing Dropout, Narrowing Scholastic Gaps and Raising Eligibility Rates for a Matriculation Certificate – Achievements and Challenges	30
1.7 Programmatic Directions	33
2. Science-Technology Education	34
2.1 The Relevant Clause of the Resolution	34
2.2 Description of Area	34
2.3 The Situation before the Resolution	38
2.4 The Situation after the Resolution	38
2.5 Achievements and Challenges	42
2.6 Programmatic Directions	44
3. Strengthening Excellent Students and Promoting Excellence	44
3.1 The Relevant Clause of the Resolution	44
3.2 Description of Area	44
3.3 The Situation before the Resolution	47
3.4 The Situation after the Resolution	47
3.5 Achievements and Challenges	48
3.6 Programmatic Directions	50

4. Career Education	50
4.1 The Relevant Clause of the Resolution	50
4.2 Description of Area	51
4.3 The Situation before the Resolution	51
4.4 The Situation after the Resolution	51
4.5 Achievements and Challenges	56
4.6 Programmatic Directions	58
5 Education Completion – Secondary School Equivalency	58
5.1 The Relevant Clause of the Resolution	58
5.2 Description of Area	58
5.3 The Situation before the Resolution	61
5.4 The Situation after the Resolution	61
5.5 Achievements and Challenge	63
5.6 Programmatic Directions	65
6. Development and Expansion of Informal Education	65
6.1 The Relevant Clause of the Resolution	65
6.2 Description of Area	65
6.3 Sub-Areas of the Activity since the Resolution	67
6.4 Achievements and Challenges	83
<b>Part III – Summary of Achievements and Challenges – an Overview</b>	86
1. Salient Achievements	86
1.1 Implementing New Programs, Improving and Expanding the Participation in Existing Programs	86
1.2 Professionalization of Implementing Staff	86
1.3 Increasing Program Sustainability	87
1.4 Raising Awareness of Various Aspects of Education	87
1.5 Forming Partnerships and Pooling Resources at the National and Local Levels	87
2. Salient Challenges	87
2.1 Difficulties in Implementing Certain Programs as Planned	87
2.2 Budgetary and Logistic Challenges	88
2.3 Non-Coordination within and between Ministries Implementing Programs for the Same Target Population	88
2.4 Lack of Appropriate Physical Infrastructures and Facilities	88
2.5 Lack of Access for Students Requiring Transportation	89
2.6 Difficulties in Recruiting and Retaining Staff	89
2.7 Weakness of Local Authorities	89
2.8 Challenges Ensuing from the Special Cultural Characteristics of Bedouin	90
2.9 Lack of Measurable Targets and Outcomes	90
<b>List of Sources</b>	91
<b>List of Interviewees</b>	94
<b>List of Study Tours</b>	97

## Appendices

Appendix I: Reducing Dropout, Narrowing Scholastic Gaps and Raising Eligibility Rates for a Matriculation Certificate	98
Appendix II: Technological Education	109
Appendix III: The Program of Excellence of the Ministry for the Development of the Negev and Galilee	110
Appendix IV: Informal Education	111

## List of Tables

### Part I – Introduction, Study Goals, Study Design, Background

Table 1: Allocation of the Education Budget according to Resolution 3708, by Area	5
---	---

### Part II - Findings

Table 2: Budget for Activities to Narrow Gaps, Enhance Scholastic Perseverance, and Raise the Matriculation Percentages as per Resolution 3708	12
Table 3: Growth in the Extent of the Nahshon Program in 2013-16	16
Table 4: Number of Schools and Groups Receiving Reinforcement in Global Hours in 2012-13	18
Table 5: Number of Schools and Groups Receiving Reinforcement in Global Hours in 2015-16	18
Table 6: Expanding Participation of <i>Let's Read Together in Arabic</i> in the Bedouin Sector, 2012-16	20
Table 7: Success in the Missing Subject/s and Eligibility for a Matriculation Certificate among Participants of the Matriculation Completion Program in the Bedouin Sector and on the National Level, 2014-15	25
Table 8: Diagnoses in the Bedouin Sector in 2012-15	28
Table 9: Budget for Science-Technology Education as per Resolution 3708	34
Table 10: Technician + Matriculation Classes, by Locality and School	38
Table 11: Startup for Industry Program – Schools and Study Tracks	40
Table 12: Participants and Dropouts from Startup for Industry Program	40
Table 13: Opening New Tracks and Upgrading Existing Ones, by Year	41
Table 14: Further Training and Seminars for the Technology Track	42
Table 15: Budget for Establishing Centers of Excellence as per Resolution 3708	44
Table 16: Year of Opening and Number of Students at Each Center of Excellence Functioning in 2016	47
Table 17: Budget for Career Education Program, as per Resolution 3708	50

Table 18:	Number of Training Sessions for Educators and Teachers in Career Education, by School Year	55
Table 19:	Number of Schools Offering the Career Education Program and Number of Classes Offering Workshops for Students, by Local Authority and School Year	56
Table 20:	Budget for Operating the Adult Education Completion Program, as per Resolution 3708	58
Table 21:	Education Completion: Tracks and Extent of Studies	59
Table 22:	Education Completion: Number of Classes by Locality in 2013-15	61
Table 23:	Education Completion: Number of Classes per Track in 2013-15	62
Table 24:	Budget for Developing and Expanding Informal Education, as per Resolution 3708	65
Table 25:	Number of Active Leadership and Social Involvement Groups in 2015, by Local Authority	77

## List of Tables in Appendices

### **Appendix I: Reducing Dropout, Narrowing Scholastic Gaps and Raising Eligibility Rates for a Matriculation Certificate**

Table I-1:	Achievements (Exam Points) of Bedouin in the Negev, Arabs (Excluding Druze and Bedouin) and Jews (State and State Religious Schools) in Grades 5 and 8 on GEMS Tests, by Sex (Multi-Year Scale)	102
Table I-2:	Achievements (Exam Points) of Bedouin in the Negev Compared with Arabs and Jews in Grades 5 and 8 on GEMS Tests (2015)	104
Table I-3:	Differences between Achievements of Bedouin in the Negev, Arabs and Jews and between Bedouin Girls and Boys in Grade 8 on GEMS Tests over the Years	105
Table I-4:	Rates of Eligibility for a General Matriculation Certificate and for a Certificate Meeting University Prerequisites among 17-Year-Olds	106
Table I-5:	Rates of Eligibility for a General Matriculation Certificate and for a Certificate Meeting University Prerequisites among all 12 <sup>th</sup> -Graders	107
Table I-6:	Rates Sitting for Matriculation Exams among all 12 <sup>th</sup> -Graders and among 17-Year-Olds	108

### **Appendix II: Technological Education**

Table II-1:	Technological Tracks, by Locality	109
-------------	-----------------------------------	-----

### **Appendix IV: Informal Education**

Table IV-1:	Number of Students in Youth Movement Groups, by Local Authority and School Year	111
Table IV-2:	Number of Active School Scouts Groups, by Local Authority and School Year	111

Table IV-3:	Number of Youngsters in Active School Scouts Groups, by Local Authority and School Year	111
Table IV-4:	Names of Schools where the School Scouts Movement Operated, in every Local Authority, in 2016	112
Table IV-5	Number of Students in Leadership and Social Involvement Groups, by Local Authority and School Year	112

## List of Figures

### Part I – Introduction, Study Goals, Study Design, Background

Figure 1:	Budget under Resolution 3708, by area, in NIS Millions and in Percentages of Total	5
-----------	--	---

### Part II – Findings

Figure 2:	Sustainability Model for Career Education Program in Secondary School in the Bedouin Sector	53
Figure 3:	Number of Youngsters in Youth Movements, 2014-2015, by Local Authority	70
Figure 4:	Number of Youngsters in School Scouts Groups, 2014-15, by Local Authority	73
Figure 5:	Number of Students in Grades 7-12 in Leadership and Social Involvement Groups, 2014-15, by Local Authority	78
Figure 6:	Number of Students in Grades 5-9 in Representative Art and Sports Groups, 2015-16, by Local Authority	80
Figure 7:	Number of Students in Kindergarten-Grade 7 who Received Subsidies to Participate in Camp, 2014-15, by Local Authority	81

### Appendix I: Reducing Dropout, Narrowing Scholastic Gaps and Raising Eligibility Rates for a Matriculation Certificate

Figure I-1:	Rate of Dropout among 17-Year-Olds over the Years: Bedouin, Arabs, and the General Population	98
Figure I-2:	Rate of Dropout among 17-Year-Olds, Boys vs. Girls	99
Figure I-3:	Rate of Dropout of Bedouin Students in the Course of their Studies from Grade 7 to Grade 12 (cohort)	100
Figure I-4:	Rate of Dropout in the Cohort that Began Grade 7 in 2010	101